



LEGISLATIVE ASSEMBLY OF MANITOBA

VOTES AND PROCEEDINGS No. 16

FIRST SESSION, THIRTY-NINTH LEGISLATURE

PRAYER

10:00 O'CLOCK A.M.

Hon. Mr. GERRARD moved:

THAT Bill (No. 205) – The Manitoba Hydro Amendment Act/Loi modifiant la Loi sur l'Hydro-Manitoba, be now read a Second Time and be referred to a Committee of this House.

And a debate arising,

And Hon. Messrs. GERRARD and ASHTON, Messrs. CULLEN, MARTINDALE, FAURSCHOU and MALOWAY having spoken,

And Mr. LAMOUREUX speaking at 11:00 a.m. The debate was allowed to remain in his name.

Ms. HOWARD moved:

Resolution No. 5: Public vs Private Health Care

WHEREAS the increasing costs of health care are largely the result of soaring drug prices, shortages of health care professionals, and the cost of services such as Pharmacare, not covered by the Canada Health Act; and

WHEREAS in public facilities, no funding is siphoned off as profit, less is spent on administration including bill collection and virtually no money is squandered on marketing; and

WHEREAS in a private health care system tax money must cover the costs of goods and services involved in health care as well as a substantial profit for shareholders; and

WHEREAS for-profit services have been consistently shown to be more costly than our public system and to boost their profits by poaching the lowest-risk patients – the young and healthy – for themselves, leaving the poor, the elderly and chronically ill to the public system; and

WHEREAS researchers at McMaster University examined the performance of 26,000 hospitals in the US over 15 years, and found that for-profit hospitals have a 2% higher death rate than not-for-profits because they cut corners by hiring less qualified staff in order to give the shareholders the needed 10 to 15% return on their investments - which translated into Canadian terms would mean the deaths of 2,200 more Canadians each year; and

Tuesday, October 9, 2007

WHEREAS private facilities lure health professionals who would otherwise be at work in public facilities, compounding shortages rather than easing them; and

WHEREAS study after study around the world has shown that allowing for-profit corporations to deliver health care services increases costs, lengthens waiting lists in the public system, and decreases the quality of care; and

WHEREAS savings from public clinics and hospitals are re-invested rather than going to shareholders; and

WHEREAS, in New Zealand, where for-profit clinics have been introduced, wait times for some vital surgeries have tripled; and

WHEREAS when private clinics are introduced, there are significantly fewer doctors able to serve the public system; and

WHEREAS an independent study by the Manitoba Centre for Health Policy found that when the previous government required patients to pay for some cataract surgeries, the wait lists for cataract surgeries without user fees were 2.5 times longer; and

WHEREAS an independent auditor's report released in December 2002 found that Ontario's plan for bringing in privately built, for-profit hospitals would cost taxpayers more in the long run than public facilities; and

WHEREAS a compilation of data from eight large studies, each of which included an average of 324 hospitals, showed that the costs of care in for-profit hospitals were 19% higher. If Canada's hospitals became profit-driven businesses, we would be paying a further \$7.2 billion each year; and

THEREFORE BE IT RESOLVED that the Legislative Assembly of Manitoba recognizes that parallel private health care would fundamentally undermine Manitoba's health care system by causing it to be less accessible, less efficient and more expensive.

And a debate arising,

And Ms. HOWARD, Mr. GOERTZEN, Hon. Ms. OSWALD, Mrs. DRIEDGER, Ms. BLADY, Hon. Mr. GERRARD and Mr. JHA having spoken,

And Mr. DYCK speaking at 12:00 p.m. The debate was allowed to remain in his name.

1:30 O'CLOCK P.M.

The following Bills were respectively read a First Time and had their purposes outlined:

(No. 3) – The Healthy Child Manitoba Act/Loi sur la stratégie « Enfants en santé Manitoba »
(Hon. Ms. IRVIN-ROSS)

(No. 7) – The Insurance Amendment Act/Loi modifiant la Loi sur les assurances
(Hon. Mr. SELINGER)

The following petitions were presented and read:

Mr. CULLEN – Legislative Assembly of Manitoba to urge the Minister for Infrastructure and Transportation to consider implementing a speed zone on Provincial Trunk Highway #2 adjacent to the Village of Glenboro. (E. Malyon, S. Collins, A. Vallotton and others)

Mr. LAMOUREUX – Legislative Assembly of Manitoba to urge the Premier and his Government to recognize and acknowledge how important immigration is to our province by improving and strengthening the Provincial Nominee Program. (D. de Leon, J. de Leon, J. Cruz and others)

Hon. Mr. RONDEAU presented:

Annual Report of the Canada/Manitoba Economic Partnership Agreement for the fiscal year ending March 31, 2007.

(Sessional Paper No. 66)

Annual Report of the Manitoba Development Corporation for the fiscal year ending March 31, 2007.

(Sessional Paper No. 67)

Annual Report of the Manitoba Opportunities Fund Limited for the fiscal year ending March 31, 2007.

(Sessional Paper No. 68)

Hon. Ms. ALLAN presented:

Annual Report of the Manitoba Women's Advisory Council for the fiscal year ending March 31, 2007.

(Sessional Paper No. 69)

Annual Report of the Department of Labour and Immigration for the fiscal year ending March 31, 2007.

(Sessional Paper No. 70)

Hon. Mr. BJORNSON presented:

Annual Report of the Department of Education, Citizenship and Youth for the fiscal year ending March 31, 2007.

(Sessional Paper No. 71)

Hon. Ms. IRVIN-ROSS presented:

Annual Report of the Healthy Child Manitoba Office for the fiscal year ending March 31, 2007.

(Sessional Paper No. 72)

Annual Report of the Manitoba Seniors and Healthy Aging Secretariat for the fiscal year ending March 31, 2007.

(Sessional Paper No. 73)

Hon. Ms. MELNICK presented:

Supplementary Information for Legislative Review 2007-2008 – Departmental Expenditure Estimates – Water Stewardship.

(Sessional Paper No. 74)

Pursuant to Rule 26(1), Messrs. DYCK and REID, Mrs. MITCHELSON, Messrs. JENNISEN and SCHULER made Members' Statements.

Following Members' Statements, Hon. Mr. GERRARD rose on a Matter of Urgent Public Importance and moved:

THAT in accordance with Rule 36(1), the ordinary business of the House be set aside to discuss a Matter of Urgent Public Importance, namely, the continued escalation of violence in Darfur and the need for Manitoba MLAs to act to raise awareness of the situation and to support Sudanese – Manitobans who are calling for urgent action to support and enhance peacemaking and peacekeeping efforts in the Darfur region.

By leave, it was agreed to proceed with the debate with the understanding that one Member from the Government, one Member from the Official Opposition and one Independent Member will speak.

And Hon. Mr. GERRARD, Messrs. ALTEMEYER and MCFADYEN having spoken.

The debate was terminated.

In accordance with Rule 27, Mr. CULLEN rose on a Grievance.

Tuesday, October 9, 2007

By leave, it was agreed to waive Private Members' Business for Thursday morning, October 11, 2007 in order for the House to resolve into Committee of Supply.

By leave, it was agreed that the Beverage Container Deposit System Resolution, previously announced for Thursday, October 11, 2007 to be considered on next Tuesday, October 16, 2007.

The House resolving into Committee of Supply.

The House then adjourned at 5:02 p.m. until 1:30 p.m. Wednesday, October 10, 2007.

Hon. George HICKES,
Speaker.