



**LEGISLATIVE ASSEMBLY OF MANITOBA**

**VOTES AND PROCEEDINGS No. 40**

**FOURTH SESSION, FORTY-FIRST LEGISLATURE**

**PRAYER**

**10:00 O'CLOCK A.M.**

The Deputy Clerk formally advised the Assembly that Madam Speaker was unavoidably absent and called upon the Deputy Speaker to take the Chair pursuant to the Statutes. The Deputy Speaker took the Chair at 10:00 a.m.

---

Mr. SARAN moved:

THAT Bill (No. 229) – The Sikh Heritage (Creation of the Khalsa) Month Act/Loi sur le Mois du patrimoine sikh (fondation du Khalsa), be now read a Second Time and be referred to a Committee of this House.

And a debate arising,

And Mr. SARAN having spoken,

And Messrs. WIEBE and SMITH (Southdale), Hon. Mr. GERRARD and Messrs MICKLEFIELD and MARTIN having questioned the Member,

And the debate continuing,

And Messrs. SMITH (Southdale), WIEBE and REYES, Ms. LAMOUREUX and Mr. MICKLEFIELD having spoken,

And the Question being put. Pursuant to Rule 23(7), the division was deferred to take place at 11:55 a.m. on Thursday, April 18, 2019.

---

Mr. MICHALESKI moved:

Resolution No. 8: Livestock Education

WHEREAS lifestyles and communities are changing, leading to a more urbanized Manitoba, which creates a greater disconnect between Manitobans and their food; and

WHEREAS market demand for protein is increasing, allowing for more production in Manitoba; and

**Tuesday, April 16, 2019**

---

WHEREAS hardworking farmers and producers deserve support and recognition for their contributions to this province; and

WHEREAS there is value added to the Manitoba economy due to the province's diversified supply chain, allowing for livestock to be fed by Manitoba grain; and

WHEREAS Manitoba's major agri-food exports in 2017 included canola (\$1.72 billion), wheat (\$991 million) and potatoes (\$460 million); and

WHEREAS the Provincial Government has continued to support and invest in the livestock industry in Manitoba, leading to growing employment opportunities in the agriculture sector; and

WHEREAS the agriculture industry in Manitoba creates many supporting jobs such as veterinary technicians, researchers and land management workers; and

WHEREAS agricultural land management and research into best practices in farming protects the natural environment and will help sustain farming operations for generations to come; and

WHEREAS Manitobans have traditionally understood the connection to their food and where it comes from, taking pride in the farming process and leading to more responsible and respectful consumption; and

WHEREAS the Provincial Government is committed to promoting agriculture through supporting various initiatives including Open Farm Day, Agriculture in the Classroom and Ag More Than Ever; and

WHEREAS educational resources from community based organizations, such as 4H clubs, have done a great job of connecting Manitobans to their food and creating greater appreciation for the farming process.

THEREFORE BE IT RESOLVED the Legislative Assembly of Manitoba encourage the Provincial Government to continue to support livestock education for Manitobans, highlighting the essential education and appreciation of the diverse agricultural supply chain that feeds people around the world.

And a debate arising,

And Mr. MICHALESKI having spoken,

And Messrs. ALLUM and WISHART, Hon. Mr. GERRARD and Messrs. ALTEMEYER, MARCELINO (Tyndall Park) and GRAYDON having questioned the Member,

And the debate continuing,

And Messrs. MARCELINO (Tyndall Park) and WISHART, Hon. Mr. GERRARD and Mr. ALTEMEYER having spoken,

And Mr. GRAYDON speaking at 12:00 p.m. The debate was allowed to remain in his name.

1:30 O'CLOCK P.M.

Pursuant to Rule 27(1), Messrs. MARTIN and GRAYDON, Hon. Mr. GOERTZEN and Messrs. ALLUM and LAMONT made Members' Statements.

---

Following Oral Questions, Madam Speaker made the following ruling:

Following the Prayer on March 15th, 2019, the Honourable Member for The Pas raised a Matter of Privilege regarding the government's intention to introduce Conflict of Interest legislation and misleading statements made by the Premier regarding his involvement with a private company. She concluded her remarks by moving: "That this matter, especially the Costa Rica part, be moved to an all-party committee for consideration."

I took the Matter of Privilege under advisement in order to consult the procedural authorities.

As the House knows, in order for the matter raised to be ruled in order as a prima facie case of privilege, Members must demonstrate that the issue has been raised at the earliest opportunity while also providing sufficient evidence that the privileges of the House have been breached.

On the condition of timeliness, the Honourable Member for The Pas indicated that this was her first opportunity to rise on this matter after having taken the time to consult the relevant authorities and experts. While I would have appreciated more information from the Member making the case for timeliness, in this instance I will accept the word of the Honourable Member that the test of timeliness was met.

Regarding the second condition of whether a prima facie case was demonstrated, I must inform the House that this matter is clearly a difference of opinion over facts. Past Manitoba Speakers have ruled on several similar occasions that a dispute between two Members as to allegations of fact does not constitute a breach of privilege. As well, Bosc and Gagnon advise on page 148 of the third edition of House of Commons Procedure and Practice that if a question of privilege involves a disagreement between two (or more) Members as to facts, the Speaker typically rules that such a dispute does not prevent Members from fulfilling their parliamentary functions, nor does such a disagreement breach the collective privileges of the House. Further, Beauchesne citation 31(1) advises that a dispute arising between two Members as to allegations of facts does not fulfill the conditions of parliamentary privilege. Finally, Joseph Maingot, on page 223 of the second edition of Parliamentary Privilege in Canada states that "A dispute between two Members about questions of facts said in debate does not constitute a valid question of privilege because it is a matter of debate."

Accordingly, I rule that a prima facie case of a breach of Privilege has not been demonstrated.

---

**Tuesday, April 16, 2019**

---

The following petitions were presented and read:

Mr. GRAYDON – Legislative Assembly of Manitoba to urge the Provincial Government to amend *The Official Time Act* to abolish daylight saving time in Manitoba effective November 4, 2019, resulting in Manitoba remaining on Central Standard Time (CST) throughout the year and in perpetuity. (T. Bueckert, R. Desrosiers, R. Boutet and others)

Hon. Mr. GERRARD – Legislative Assembly of Manitoba to urge the Provincial Government to increase funding for licensed not for profit child care programs in recognition of the importance of early learning and child care in Manitoba which will also improve quality and stability in the workforce. (A. Forsythe, J. Taylor, B. Cabral and others)

Mr. LAMONT – Legislative Assembly of Manitoba to urge the Provincial Government to increase funding for licensed not for profit child care programs in recognition of the importance of early learning and child care in Manitoba which will also improve quality and stability in the workforce. (S. Hiebert, K. Kuhl, B. Furet and others)

---

In accordance with Rule 33(7), the Government House Leader announced that the Respecting Manitoba's Climate and Green Plan Resolution will be considered on the next Tuesday of Private Members' Business.

---

The House resumed the debate on the Proposed Motion of Hon. Mr. FIELDING:

THAT Bill (No. 16) – The Budget Implementation and Tax Statutes Amendment Act, 2019/Loi d'exécution du budget de 2019 et modifiant diverses dispositions législatives en matière de fiscalité, be now read a Second Time and be referred to a Committee of this House.

And the debate continuing,

And Ms. FONTAINE and Hon. Mr. GOERTZEN having spoken,

And the Question being put. It was agreed to on the following division:

**YEA**

ALTEMEYER  
BINDLE  
CLARKE  
COX  
CULLEN  
EICHLER  
EWASKO  
FIELDING  
FLETCHER  
FONTAINE  
FRIESEN  
GERRARD  
GOERTZEN  
GRAYDON  
GUILLEMARD  
HELWER  
ISLEIFSON  
JOHNSON  
JOHNSTON  
KINEW  
KLASSEN  
LAGASSÉ  
LAGIMODIERE  
LAMONT  
LAMOUREUX  
LATHLIN

LINDSEY  
MALOWAY  
MARCELINO (Logan)  
MARCELINO (Tyndall Park)  
MARTIN  
MAYER  
MICHALESKI  
MICKLEFIELD  
MORLEY-LECOMTE  
NESBITT  
PEDERSEN  
PIWNIUK  
REYES  
SMITH (Point Douglas)  
SMITH (Southdale)  
SMOOK  
SQUIRES  
STEFANSON  
SWAN  
TEITSMA  
WHARTON  
WIEBE  
WISHART  
WOWCHUK  
YAKIMOSKI..... 51

**NAY**

.....0

The Bill was accordingly read a Second Time and referred to Committee of the Whole.

The House then adjourned at 5:01 p.m. until 1:30 p.m. Wednesday, April 17, 2019.

Hon. Myrna DRIEDGER,  
Speaker.