

**Second Session - Fortieth Legislature**  
of the  
**Legislative Assembly of Manitoba**  
**DEBATES**  
and  
**PROCEEDINGS**

**Official Report**  
**(Hansard)**

*Published under the  
authority of  
The Honourable Daryl Reid  
Speaker*

**Vol. LXV No. 76 - 1:30 p.m., Wednesday, July 17, 2013**

ISSN 0542-5492

**MANITOBA LEGISLATIVE ASSEMBLY**  
**Fortieth Legislature**

<b>Member</b>	<b>Constituency</b>	<b>Political Affiliation</b>
ALLAN, Nancy, Hon.	St. Vital	NDP
ALLUM, James	Fort Garry-Riverview	NDP
ALTEMEYER, Rob	Wolseley	NDP
ASHTON, Steve, Hon.	Thompson	NDP
BJORNSON, Peter, Hon.	Gimli	NDP
BLADY, Sharon	Kirkfield Park	NDP
BRAUN, Erna	Rossmere	NDP
BRIESE, Stuart	Agassiz	PC
CALDWELL, Drew	Brandon East	NDP
CHIEF, Kevin, Hon.	Point Douglas	NDP
CHOMIAK, Dave, Hon.	Kildonan	NDP
CROTHERS, Deanne	St. James	NDP
CULLEN, Cliff	Spruce Woods	PC
DEWAR, Gregory	Selkirk	NDP
DRIEDGER, Myrna	Charleswood	PC
EICHLER, Ralph	Lakeside	PC
EWASKO, Wayne	Lac du Bonnet	PC
FRIESEN, Cameron	Morden-Winkler	PC
GAUDREAU, Dave	St. Norbert	NDP
GERRARD, Jon, Hon.	River Heights	Liberal
GOERTZEN, Kelvin	Steinbach	PC
GRAYDON, Cliff	Emerson	PC
HELWER, Reg	Brandon West	PC
HOWARD, Jennifer, Hon.	Fort Rouge	NDP
IRVIN-ROSS, Kerri, Hon.	Fort Richmond	NDP
JHA, Bidhu	Radisson	NDP
KOSTYSHYN, Ron, Hon.	Swan River	NDP
LEMIEUX, Ron, Hon.	Dawson Trail	NDP
MACKINTOSH, Gord, Hon.	St. Johns	NDP
MAGUIRE, Larry	Arthur-Virden	PC
MALOWAY, Jim	Elmwood	NDP
MARCELINO, Flor, Hon.	Logan	NDP
MARCELINO, Ted	Tyndall Park	NDP
MELNICK, Christine, Hon.	Riel	NDP
MITCHELSON, Bonnie	River East	PC
NEVAKSHONOFF, Tom	Interlake	NDP
OSWALD, Theresa, Hon.	Seine River	NDP
PALLISTER, Brian	Fort Whyte	PC
PEDERSEN, Blaine	Midland	PC
PETTERSEN, Clarence	Flin Flon	NDP
REID, Daryl, Hon.	Transcona	NDP
ROBINSON, Eric, Hon.	Kewatinook	NDP
RONDEAU, Jim, Hon.	Assiniboia	NDP
ROWAT, Leanne	Riding Mountain	PC
SARAN, Mohinder	The Maples	NDP
SCHULER, Ron	St. Paul	PC
SELBY, Erin, Hon.	Southdale	NDP
SELINGER, Greg, Hon.	St. Boniface	NDP
SMOOK, Dennis	La Verendrye	PC
STEFANSON, Heather	Tuxedo	PC
STRUTHERS, Stan, Hon.	Dauphin	NDP
SWAN, Andrew, Hon.	Minto	NDP
WHITEHEAD, Frank	The Pas	NDP
WIEBE, Matt	Concordia	NDP
WIGHT, Melanie	Burrows	NDP
WISHART, Ian	Portage la Prairie	PC
<i>Vacant</i>	Morris	

**LEGISLATIVE ASSEMBLY OF MANITOBA**

**Wednesday, July 17, 2013**

*The House met at 1:30 p.m.*

**Mr. Speaker:** O Eternal and Almighty God, from Whom all power and wisdom come, we are assembled here before Thee to frame such laws as may tend to the welfare and prosperity of our province. Grant, O merciful God, we pray Thee, that we may desire only that which is in accordance with Thy will, that we may seek it with wisdom, know it with certainty and accomplish it perfectly for the glory and honour of Thy name and for the welfare of all our people. Amen.

Good afternoon, everyone. Please be seated.

**ROUTINE PROCEEDINGS**

**Mr. Speaker:** Seeing no bills, we'll move to—

**PETITIONS**

**Provincial Sales Tax Increase—Referendum**

**Mrs. Myrna Driedger (Charleswood):** I wish to present the following petition to the Legislative Assembly.

And these are the reasons for this petition:

The provincial government promised not to raise taxes in the last election.

Through Bill 20, the provincial government wants to increase the retail sales tax, known as the PST, by one point without the legally required referendum.

An increase to the PST is excessive taxation that will harm Manitoba families.

Bill 20 strips Manitobans of their democratic right to determine when major tax increases are necessary.

We petition the Legislative Assembly of Manitoba as follows:

To urge the provincial government to not raise the PST without holding a provincial referendum.

And this is signed by G. Fedora, J. Kenny, R. Fataua and many others.

**Mr. Speaker:** In accordance with our rule 132(6), when petitions are read they are deemed to have been received by the House.

Further petitions?

**Applied Behaviour Analysis Services**

**Mr. Cameron Friesen (Morden-Winkler):** I wish to present the following petition to the Legislative Assembly.

And the background to this petition is as follows:

The provincial government broke a commitment to support families with children with a diagnosis of autism spectrum disorder, including timely diagnosis and access to necessary treatment such as applied behavioural analysis, also known as ABA services.

The provincial government did not follow its own policy statement on autism services which notes the importance of early intervention for children with autism.

School learning services has its first ever waiting list which started with two children. Waiting list is projected to keep growing and to be in excess of 20 children by September 2013. Therefore, these children will go through the biggest transition of their lives without receiving ABA services that has helped other children achieve huge gains.

The provincial government has adopted a policy to eliminate ABA services in schools by grade 5 despite the fact that these children have been diagnosed with autism which still requires therapy. These children are being denied necessary ABA services that will allow them access to the same educational opportunities as any other Manitoban.

Waiting lists and denials of treatment are unacceptable. No child should be denied access to or eliminated from eligibility for ABA services if their need still exists.

We petition the Legislative Assembly of Manitoba as follows:

To request that the Minister of Education consider making funding available to eliminate the current waiting list for ABA school-age services and fund ABA services for individuals diagnosed with autism spectrum disorder.

And this petition is signed by T. Martin, E. Osudar, N. Jacobson and many, many others.

### **St. Ambroise Beach Provincial Park**

**Mr. Ian Wishart (Portage la Prairie):** I wish to present the following petition to the Legislative Assembly of Manitoba.

And these are the reasons for the petition:

The St. Ambroise provincial park was hard hit by the 2011 flood, resulting in the park's ongoing closure and loss of local access to Lake Manitoba, as well as untold harm to the ecosystem and wildlife in the region.

The park's closure is having a negative impact in many areas, including disruptions to the local tourism, hunting and fishing operations, diminished economic and employment opportunities and potential loss of the local store and decrease in property values.

Local residents and visitors alike want St. Ambroise provincial park to be reopened as soon as possible.

We petition the Legislative Assembly of Manitoba as follows:

To request that the appropriate ministers of the provincial government consider repairing St. Ambroise provincial park and its access points to their pre-flood condition so the park can be reopened for the 2013 season or earlier if possible.

This petition's signed by R. Maxwell, S. Williams, R. Mitler and many, many more fine Manitobans.

### **Reopen Beausejour's Employment Manitoba Office**

**Mr. Wayne Ewasko (Lac du Bonnet):** I wish to present the following petition to the Legislative Assembly.

These are the reasons for this petition:

(1) The RM of Brokenhead and the town of Beausejour are growing centres with a combined population of over 8,000.

(2) Employment Manitoba offices provide crucial career counselling, job search and training opportunities for local residents looking to advance their education.

(3) The recent closure of Employment Manitoba's Beausejour office will have negative consequences for the area's population who want to upgrade their skills and employment opportunities.

We petition the Legislative Assembly of Manitoba as follows:

To urge the provincial government to reopen Beausejour's Employment Manitoba office.

This petition is signed by D. Werry, R. Riels, A. Hopkins and many, many more fine Manitobans, Mr. Speaker.

### **Applied Behaviour Analysis Services**

**Mrs. Leanne Rowat (Riding Mountain):** I wish to present the following petition to the Legislative Assembly of Manitoba.

And these are the reasons for this petition:

The provincial government broke a commitment to support families of children with a diagnosis of autism spectrum disorder, including timely diagnosis and access to necessary treatment such as applied behaviour analysis, also known as ABA services.

The provincial government did not follow its own policy statement on autism services which notes the importance of early intervention for children with autism.

This preschool waiting list for ABA services has reached its highest level ever with at least 56 children waiting for services. That number is expected to exceed 70 children by September 2013 despite commitments to reduce the waiting list and provide timely access to services.

The provincial government policy of eliminating ABA services in schools by grade 5 has caused many children in Manitoba to age out of the window for this very effective ABA treatment because of a lack of access. Many more children are expected to age out because of a lack of available treatment spaces.

Waiting lists and denials of treatment are unacceptable. No child should be denied access to or age out of eligibility for ABA services.

We petition the Legislative Assembly of Manitoba as follows:

To request that the Minister of Family Services and Labour consider making funding available to address the current waiting list for ABA services.

This petition's signed by R. Linsangan, M. Pabunan, O. Cruz and many more concerned Manitobans.

\* (13:40)

**Mr. Blaine Pedersen (Midland):** I wish to present the following petition to the Legislative Assembly.

The background to this petition is as follows:

The provincial government broke a commitment to support families of children with a diagnosis of autism spectrum disorder, including timely diagnosis and access to necessary treatment such as applied behavioural analysis, also known as ABA services.

The provincial government did not follow its own policy statement on autism services which notes the importance of early intervention for children with autism.

The preschool waiting list for ABA services has reached its highest level ever with at least 56 children waiting for services. That number is expected to exceed 70 children by September 2013 despite commitments to reduce the waiting list and provide timely access to services.

The provincial government policy of eliminating ABA services in schools by grade 5 has caused many children in Manitoba to age out of the window for this very effective ABA treatment because of a lack of access. Many more children are expected to age out because of a lack of available treatment spaces.

Waiting lists and denials of treatment are unacceptable. No child should be denied access to or age out of eligibility for ABA services.

We petition the Legislative Assembly of Manitoba as follows:

To request that the Minister of Family Services and Labour consider making funding available to address the current waiting list for ABA services.

And this petition is signed by L. Lisowaska, T. Lisowaska, W. Taylor and many more fine Manitobans.

**Mr. Cliff Cullen (Spruce Woods):** I wish to present the following petition to the Legislative Assembly.

The background to this petition is as follows:

The provincial government broke a commitment to support families of children with a diagnosis of autism spectrum disorder, including timely diagnosis and access to necessary treatment such as applied behavioural analysis, also known as ABA services.

The provincial government did not follow its own policy statement on autism services which notes the importance of early intervention for children with autism.

School learning services has its first ever waiting list which started with two children. The waiting list is projected to keep growing to be in excess of 20 children by September 2013. Therefore, these children will go through the biggest transition of their lives without receiving ABA services that has helped other children achieve huge gains.

The provincial government has adopted a policy to eliminate ABA services in schools by grade 5 despite the fact that these children have been diagnosed with autism which still requires therapy. These children are being denied necessary ABA services that will allow them access to the same educational opportunities as any other Manitoban.

Waiting lists and denials of treatment are unacceptable. No child should be denied access to or eliminated from eligibility for ABA services if their need still exists.

We petition the Legislative Assembly of Manitoba as follows:

To request that the Minister of Education consider making funding available to eliminate the current waiting list for ABA school-age services and fund ABA services for individuals diagnosed with autism spectrum disorder.

This petition is signed by J. Shiells, M. Moore, D. Becker and many other fine Manitobans.

### **Personal Care Homes and Long-Term Care—Ashern**

**Mr. Ralph Eichler (Lakeside):** Good afternoon, Mr. Speaker. I wish to present the following petition to this Legislative Assembly of Manitoba.

These are the reasons for this petition:

(1) There has been much discussion in the past few weeks with community members in Ashern and surrounding areas with regard to the lack of beds at the Ashern Personal Care Home. At the present time, there are 20 beds being used to full capacity and there are approximately 15 to 20 clients on a waiting list for placement.

(2) Many clients have had to go outside the community to find placement in a personal care home in other communities such as Ste. Rose, Eriksdale, Lunder and St. Adolphe.

(3) In one instance, a husband and wife were separated, sending one to Ashern, the other to Eriksdale because of the lack of beds, making the

situation extremely hard on family members and clients.

(4) With two municipalities and five First Nation communities in the area, there is immediate need for increase to 10 to 12 beds to the Ashern Personal Care Home.

We petition this Legislative Assembly of Manitoba as follows:

To request the Minister of Health consider building an addition to the Ashern Personal Care Home to accommodate the growing need for placement in the community.

This petition is submitted on behalf of A. Chartrand, W. Chartrand, J. Sigfusson and many other fine Manitobans.

#### **Applied Behaviour Analysis Services**

**Mrs. Heather Stefanson (Tuxedo):** I wish to present the following petition to the Legislative Assembly.

And this is the background—or the background to this petition is as follows:

(1) The provincial government broke a commitment to support families of children with a diagnosis of autism spectrum disorder, including timely diagnosis and access to necessary treatment such as applied behavioural analysis, also known as ABA services.

(2) The provincial government did not follow its own policy statement on autism services which notes the importance of early intervention for children with autism.

(3) The preschool waiting list for ABA services has reached its highest level ever with at least 56 children waiting for services. That number is expected to exceed 70 children by September 2013 despite commitments to reduce the waiting list and provide timely access to services.

(4) The provincial government policy of eliminating ABA services in schools by grade 5 has caused many children in Manitoba to age out of the window for this very effective ABA treatment because of a lack of access. Many more children are expected to age out because of the lack of available treatment spaces.

(5) Waiting lists and denials of treatment are unacceptable. No child should be denied access to or age out of eligibility for ABA services.

We petition the Legislative Assembly of Manitoba as follows:

To request that the Minister of Family Services and Labour consider making funding available to address the current waiting list for ABA services.

And, Mr. Speaker, this petition is signed by C. Price, A. Adriano, Y. Quinto and many, many other fine Manitobans.

**Mr. Larry Maguire (Arthur-Virden):** Mr. Speaker, I wish to present the following petition to the Legislative Assembly of Manitoba.

And the background to this petition is as follows:

(1) The provincial government broke a commitment to support families of children with a diagnosis of autism spectrum disorder, including timely diagnosis and access to necessary treatment such as applied behavioural analysis, also known as ABA services.

(2) The provincial government did not follow its own policy statement on autism services which notes the importance of early intervention for children with autism.

(3) The preschool waiting list for ABA services has reached its highest level ever with at least 56 children waiting for services. That number is expected to exceed 70 children by September 2013 despite commitments to reduce the waiting list and provide timely access to services.

(4) The provincial government policy of eliminating ABA services in schools by grade 5 has caused many children in Manitoba to age out of the window for this very effective ABA treatment because of a lack of access. Many more children are expected to age out because of the lack of available treatment spaces.

(5) Waiting lists and denials of treatment are unacceptable. No child should be denied access to or age out of eligibility for ABA services.

We petition the Legislative Assembly of Manitoba as follows:

To request that the Minister of Family Services and Labour consider making funding available to address the current waiting list for ABA services.

And, Mr. Speaker, this petition is signed by A. Bubnowicz, J. Lodge, J. Janzen and many, many others.

**Mr. Stuart Briese (Agassiz):** I wish to present the following petition to the Legislative Assembly of Manitoba.

And these are the reasons for this petition:

\* (13:50)

The provincial government broke a commitment to support families of children with a diagnosis of autism spectrum disorder, including timely diagnosis and access to necessary treatment such as applied behavioural analysis, also known as ABA services.

The provincial government did not follow its own policy statement on autism services which notes the importance of early intervention for children with autism.

The preschool waiting list for ABA services has reached its highest level ever with at least 56 children waiting for services. The number is expected to exceed 70 children by September 2013 despite commitments to reduce the waiting list and provide timely access to services.

The provincial government policy of eliminating ABA services in schools by grade 5 has caused many children in Manitoba to age out of the window for this very effective ABA treatment because of lack of access. Many more children are expected to age out because of a lack of available treatment spaces.

Waiting lists and denials of treatment are unacceptable. No child should be denied access to or age out of eligibility for ABA services.

We petition the Legislative Assembly of Manitoba as follows:

To request that the Minister of Family Services and Labour consider making funding available to address the current waiting list for ABA services.

This petition is signed by E. Dvorak, M. Dvorak, C. Dvorak and many, many other fine Manitobans.

#### **Provincial Sales Tax Increase—Referendum**

**Mrs. Bonnie Mitchelson (River East):** I wish to present the following petition to the Legislative Assembly of Manitoba.

And these are the reasons for this petition:

The provincial government promised not to raise taxes in the last election.

Through Bill 20, the provincial government wants to increase the retail sales tax, known as the

PST, by one point without the legally required referendum.

An increase to the PST is excessive taxation that will harm Manitoba families.

Bill 20 strips Manitobans of their democratic right to determine when major tax increases are necessary.

We petition the Legislative Assembly of Manitoba as follows:

To urge the provincial government to not raise the PST without holding a provincial referendum.

And this petition is signed by E. Scrapneck, W. Woroniak, R. Cassidy and thousands of other Manitobans.

#### **Applied Behaviour Analysis Services**

**Mr. Reg Helwer (Brandon West):** I wish to present the following petition to the Legislative Assembly of Manitoba.

The background to this petition is as follows:

(1) The provincial government broke a commitment to support families of children with a diagnosis of autism spectrum disorder, including timely diagnosis and access to necessary treatment such as applied behavioural analysis, also known as ABA services.

(2) The provincial government did not follow its own policy statement on autism services which notes the importance of early intervention for children with autism.

(3) School learning services has its first ever waiting list which started with two children. The waiting list is projected to keep growing and to be in excess of 20 children by September 2013. Therefore, these children will go through the biggest transition of their lives without receiving ABA services that has helped other children achieve huge gains.

(4) The provincial government has adopted a policy to eliminate ABA services in schools by grade 5 despite the fact that these children have been diagnosed with autism which still requires therapy. These children are being denied necessary ABA services that will allow them access to the same educational opportunities as any other Manitoban.

(5) Waiting lists and denials of treatment are unacceptable. No child should be denied access to or eliminated from eligibility for ABA services if their need still exists.

We petition the Legislative Assembly of Manitoba as follows:

To request that the Minister of Education consider making funding available to eliminate the current waiting list for ABA school-age services and fund ABA services for individuals diagnosed with autism spectrum disorder.

Signed by L. Dutta, F. Desinet, C. Slywchuk and many other Manitobans.

**Mr. Ron Schuler (St. Paul):** I wish to present the following petition to the Legislative Assembly of Manitoba.

The background to this petition is as follows:

(1) The provincial government broke a commitment to support families of children with the diagnosis of autism spectrum disorder, including timely diagnosis and access to necessary treatment such as applied behavioural analysis, also known as ABA services.

(2) The provincial government did not follow its own policy statement on autism services which notes the importance of early intervention for children with autism.

(3) School learning services has its first ever waiting list which started with two children. The waiting list is projected to keep growing and to be in excess of 20 children by September 2013. Therefore these children will go through the biggest transition of their lives without receiving ABA services that has helped other children achieve huge gains.

(4) The provincial government has adopted a policy to eliminate ABA services in schools by grade 5 despite the fact that these children have been diagnosed with autism which still requires therapy. These children are being denied access—denied necessary ABA services that will allow them access to the same educational opportunities as any other Manitoban.

(5) Waiting lists and denials of treatment are unacceptable. No child should be denied access to or eliminated from eligibility for ABA services if their need still exists.

We petition the Legislative Assembly of Manitoba as follows:

To request that the Minister of Education consider making funding available to eliminate the current waiting list for ABA school-age services and

fund ABA services for individuals diagnosed with autism spectrum disorder.

This is signed by K. Land, D. Godfrey, A. Moubray and many, many other Manitobans.

**Mr. Dennis Smook (La Verendrye):** I wish to present the following petition to the Legislative Assembly.

The background to this petition is as follows:

The provincial government broke a commitment to support families of children with a diagnosis of autism spectrum disorder, including timely diagnosis and access to necessary treatment such as applied behavioural analysis, also known as ABA services.

The provincial government did not follow its own policy statement on autism services which notes the importance of early intervention for children with autism.

The preschool waiting list for ABA services has reached its highest level ever with at least 56 children waiting for services. That number is expected to exceed 70 children by September 2013 despite commitments to reduce the waiting list and provide timely access to services.

The provincial government policy of eliminating ABA services in schools by grade 5 has caused many children in Manitoba to age out of the window for this very effective ABA treatment because of lack of access. Many more children are expected to age out because of a lack of available treatment spaces.

Waiting lists and denials of treatment are unacceptable. No child should be denied access to or age out of eligibility for ABA services.

We petition the Legislative Assembly of Manitoba as follows:

\* (14:00)

To request the Minister of Family Services and Labour consider making funding available to address the current waiting list for ABA services.

This petition is signed by L. Simpson, C. Hamm, G. Sally and many more fine Manitobans.

**Mr. Cliff Graydon (Emerson):** I wish to present the following petition to the Legislative Assembly of Manitoba.

The background to this petition is as follows:

The provincial government broke a commitment to support families of children with diagnosis of



autism spectrum disorder, including timely diagnosis and access to necessary treatment such as applied behavioural analysis, also known as ABA services.

(2) The provincial government did not follow its own policy statement on autism services which notes the importance of early intervention for children with autism.

(3) The preschool waiting list for ABA services has reached its highest level ever with at least 56 children waiting for services. That number is expected to exceed 70 children by September 2013 despite commitments to reduce the waiting list and provide timely access to services.

The provincial government's policy of eliminating ABA services in schools by grade 5 has caused many children in Manitoba to age out of the window for this very effective ABA treatment because of a lack of access. Many more children are expected to age out because of a lack of available treatment spaces.

(5) Waiting lists and denial of treatment are unacceptable. No child should be denied access to or age out of eligibility for ABA services.

We petition the Legislative Assembly of Manitoba as follows:

To request that the Minister of Family Services and Labour consider making funding available to address the current waiting list for ABA services.

And this petition is signed by R. Shewchuk, G. Shewchuk and V. Osterhout and many, many more fine Manitobans.

**Mrs. Rowat:** Point of order, Mr. Speaker.

#### Point of Order

**Mr. Speaker:** Honourable member for Riding Mountain, on a point of order.

**Mrs. Rowat:** While petitions were being read, I heard the member for Interlake (Mr. Nevakshonoff) indicate that petitions, especially the ones during this side of the House presentation were on autism—he indicated to this side of the House that they are a waste of time.

Children, advocating through their parents, through family members, through individuals who are concerned with this issue, Mr. Speaker, have taken the time to not only sign petitions, they have been in the gallery, they've attended question period, they've attended private member resolutions, and

what they want to see is a government follow through on a promise that they made just before the election through their Thrive! document that they would support the policies in early intervention, early diagnosis, access to treatment and talk about how they're going to be dealing with wait times that are increasing, not only young children who are being diagnosed prior to school but also school-age children. And these wait-lists are growing. So without treatment these children are aging out, they're not getting the supports they require and they are actually being denied the opportunity to access education supports and to prosper and grow with the right supports.

So I am very offended by the member for Interlake to put on the—you know, to yell across the floor that this was a waste of time, Mr. Speaker. I think it's a disservice to the Manitobans across the province who have put forward petitions to get the ear of this government. I think it's disrespectful that this government actually puts out a document just before the election and doesn't fulfill that promise. Thank you.

**Mr. Speaker:** The honourable Government House Leader, on the same point of order.

**Hon. Jennifer Howard (Government House Leader):** I didn't hear the comment that the member raises. I didn't hear a point of order. I didn't hear a rule that she's cited, which is something you've been very clear in letting us know.

But I will tell you what I find disrespectful and what I find a waste of time. I find spending two and half weeks of this legislative session ringing the bells, delaying the passage of a budget, delaying—yesterday saying no to Interim Supply when the week before the Leader of the Opposition committed to passing it. I find that reckless, frankly, Mr. Speaker. I find delaying increases to daycare centres, delaying increases to non-profit organizations for no other reason than because you think that you're scoring a political point or you think it furthers your negotiating position, I find that reckless. I don't think that's a leader, and I think that that is something that the opposition should be held to account for.

**Mr. Speaker:** Order, please.

On the point of order raised by the honourable member for Riding Mountain (Mrs. Rowat), I did not hear the comments that she is alleging were made by another member of this House. And also at the same time I did not hear a rule that was breached as a

result of comments that may have been made. She—the honourable member for Riding Mountain (Mrs. Rowat) did not reference any specific rule, practice or procedure that would guide us through matters such as this.

I'm also noticing, as I've indicated in past, that the House is—occasionally, members are using this time to debate matters that would more appropriately have been debated either during questions or in comments in other forums such as committee or on specific pieces of legislation, so I would discourage members from using points of order to debate matters.

And I must respectfully rule that since there was no particular rule that was referenced that I could have indicated that there was a breach upon, I must respectfully rule that there is no point of order.

\* \* \*

**Mr. Speaker:** Any further petitions? Seeing none, I will move on to committee reports.

Seeing no committee reports, tabling of reports.

Seeing no tabling of reports—

#### Introduction of Guests

**Mr. Speaker:** Prior to oral questions, I'd like to draw the attention of honourable members to the public gallery where we have with us today members from Food Matters Manitoba, who are the guests of the honourable member for The Pas (Mr. Whitehead). On behalf of honourable members, we welcome you here today.

### ORAL QUESTIONS

#### PST Increase

#### Impact on Cross-Border Shopping

**Mr. Brian Pallister (Leader of the Official Opposition):** Mr. Speaker, last weekend my wife and I had the wonderful opportunity to attend the Roblin centennial and to visit a number of communities in the beautiful parkland of our province. I'd encourage all members of this House to do the same and visit that area. It's beautiful.

And I had the chance to get some input from various community leaders. They were, to a person, concerned about loss of retail trade in their areas, chiefly, in that part of the province, to Saskatchewan, and the community of Yorkton was mentioned quite frequently. Apparently, many shoppers are using the advantage of the proximity to Yorkton to drive over,

load up once a week and they're using their local stores as convenience stores. And this behaviour's increased as a consequence of the increase in the PST by this government.

This loss of business poses a particular threat to the economic health of border communities such as these who are closer to a lower tax jurisdiction.

And I guess I would ask the Premier, because the people of our province, all of us, love these communities so much, we're very concerned that they don't hollow out, Mr. Speaker, that they don't lose their retail trade, and the vitality that's so important to them is important to all of us.

I'd ask the Premier if he could table any research that he did, prior to imposing the PST on these communities and all Manitobans, that demonstrates that he's given this some thought.

**Hon. Greg Selinger (Premier):** Mr. Speaker, the member will know that we have a period of continuing economic uncertainty. He will know that we received a report recommending an additional \$1-billion investment in flood protection for the people around Lake Manitoba and Lake St. Martin.

He will know that we already committed and spent \$1.25 billion on flood—the flood of 2011. And in that context, he will know that a commitment to infrastructure to have communities that are safe, to have communities with proper roads, to ensure that we continue to build schools and personal care homes, was an essential part of our decision-making process to move Manitoba forward and to keep Manitoba one of the places where we have one of the best growing economies in the country, Mr. Speaker, with the second lowest unemployment rate in Canada.

Those are the factors we consider: how to keep growing the province, protecting essential services and ensuring people are safe from floods, Mr. Speaker.

**Mr. Pallister:** Sadly, zero evidence of any foresight, Mr. Speaker, and the fact is you don't build a solid economy with ribbons. Real businesses need to attract real customers to their doors and they do that in various ways. One of those ways is a sale, because prices matter, and certainly a lower price can draw shoppers.

\* (14:10)

What the Premier's sales tax is is essentially an unsale. It does the opposite. Rather than attract

shoppers to our province and to our communities, it repels shoppers. And it repels Manitobans, too, because Manitobans are smart shoppers, Mr. Speaker. They look for a good deal. They shop around and they have \$1,600 less because of NDP broken-promise taxes per household to shop with. So the reality is that this Premier (Mr. Selinger) hasn't demonstrated that he has an understanding that by lowering Manitoba's incomes and hiking their taxes he may be encouraging those smart shoppers out the door of this province.

Would he, again, use this opportunity to table any research that he has done that demonstrates that he understands the problem he's creating by jacking up promises and breaking—jacking up taxes and breaking his promise to Manitobans?

**Mr. Selinger:** Mr. Speaker, the most important priority for every Manitoban is to have a job. That's why we're very proud. That's why we're very pleased with the latest unemployment statistics which put us tied for the second lowest unemployment rate in the country with Alberta.

And, Mr. Speaker, we're seeing more people come to Manitoba than ever before, not only to live here, they're coming here to see the Jets play at the MTS Centre downtown—that the members opposed. They're coming here to see a football game at the new stadium—that the members opposed. They're going to be coming here to see the new world-class exhibit that we have at the Assiniboine Park Zoo. They're going to be coming here to see the internationally renowned human rights centre that's being built in this city. And, when they come here, they will find they have employment opportunities. They will find they have affordable housing. They will find they have decent schools and public services that have been—not been cut to the tune of \$550 million like the members opposite propose to do.

**Mr. Pallister:** The Premier seems to believe that by repeating false information he can make it believable, but he just erodes his own credibility. This is a Premier who leads the country in one thing, Mr. Speaker, and that's keeping unemployment low by exporting people. Exporting people from our province isn't the answer.

This is not a Premier who knows how to shop smart. No smart shopper would spend a billion dollars to put a hydro line 300 miles out of the way. This Premier is raising the PST by 14 per cent and expecting he'll get a corresponding increase in

revenue. But he doesn't understand Manitoba shoppers very well. They aren't prisoners here. They aren't captive here, and the reality is border communities such as Roblin and Swan River, Virden, others—Russell, many others—are going to lose income and they're losing businesses and jobs. And the selection that they should enjoy, they are also losing. They're hollowing out and they're afraid of being hollowed out by high-tax, high-spend policies. And high-tax, high-spend policies are eroding the business communities in this province.

Would the Premier table some evidence that he understands this problem?

**Mr. Selinger:** Mr. Speaker, it's only the Leader of the Opposition and his caucus that want to stop building Manitoba Hydro in the province of Manitoba. Literally, thousands of jobs will be created and they'll be created in partnership with our First Nations brothers and sisters in northern Manitoba. They will have first opportunity for the training, first opportunity for the jobs and be full partners in the development of our hydro projects. That is a project that the member wants to stop. That will drive people out of Manitoba. We will be bringing them in so that they can have those employment opportunities.

Mr. Speaker, he talks about the additional hydro line. We are working with our First Nation citizens on the east side of Manitoba for a world-class UNESCO World Heritage Site, something that will bring tourism to Manitoba from all around the world. He wants to halt that project.

And Mr. Speaker, we had nearly 15,000 people move to Manitoba last year. Only the Leader of the Opposition does not want to count those new citizens in Manitoba.

#### **PST Increase Request to Reverse**

**Mr. Reg Helwer (Brandon West):** Well, that's pretty rich, Mr. Speaker, coming from a Premier who is creating fear in mine—Manitoba Hydro employees that he will sell Manitoba Hydro. Isn't that rich?

Mr. Speaker, Colin Craig of the Canadian Taxpayers Federation brought over 8,000 petitions to the Legislature today asking the NDP government to keep their 20 election—2011 election promise and leave the PST at 7 per cent. I wish to table some of those petitions here today.

Mr. Speaker, will the Premier listen to Manitobans and reverse the PST increase?

**Hon. Greg Selinger (Premier):** I thank the member for the question.

Certainly, we have received the petition, Mr. Speaker, and we have heard the people all around Manitoba say, first priority, keep communities safe, which is why we committed \$250 million to protect the people in Lake Manitoba and Lake St. Martin, which is why we committed \$20 million to protect the people of Brandon. Those are priorities, and we will listen to those priorities as we move forward in the province of Manitoba to make it a safe place to live where people have employment.

#### **Referendum Request**

**Mr. Helwer:** Well, Mr. Speaker, part of the problem is this government's priorities seem to change. Just about every day they come up with a new one.

You know, Mr. Speaker, Manitobans are angry that this NDP government lied to them during the 2011 election, and now they're trying to take away the right to vote in a referendum on the PST increase in Bill 20.

Mr. Speaker, will the Premier listen to Manitobans and allow them to vote in a referendum on the PST increase?

**Mr. Selinger:** Mr. Speaker, the members opposite are proposing \$550 million in cuts to front-line services in the province of Manitoba. That's hundreds of teachers losing their jobs. That's hundreds of nurses losing their jobs. That's front-line workers to provide addiction services, corrections services, policing services in the province of Manitoba, losing their jobs. What kind of province would we have then? The same province that we had in the '90s where people were leaving in record numbers, where disposable income was going down, hydro projects were being cancelled and people were being put on the street on unemployment.

If the member from Brandon West wants to go back to that, I say to him, it is the wrong direction. The direction is to build the province of Manitoba, build the economy of Manitoba, build up the skills of the citizens of Manitoba so they can participate in the economy.

#### **Presentation of Petitions**

**Mr. Helwer:** Well, Mr. Speaker, there you have it again, you know, the Premier trying to scare Manitobans, and he'd prefer to talk about the '90s rather than his government's failed record.

But, you know, Mr. Speaker, the Premier refers to the Manitoba Legislature as the people's House. Today, Colin Craig was forced to wait in the entrance until I had to escort him up to the Premier's office to present over 8,000 petitions asking the NDP government to keep their 2011 election promise and leave the PST at 7 per cent.

Mr. Speaker, is the people's House now closed to the public or just some of the public?

**Mr. Selinger:** Mr. Speaker, I appreciate the member from Brandon West helping anybody come and visit the Legislature to present their information, which is why we were very pleased to have the hearings on Bill 20. I only wish the members opposite would afford the same courtesy to people that want to present on Bill 18. They're refusing—

**Some Honourable Members:** Oh, oh.

**Mr. Selinger:** They are refusing to give them the opportunity to be heard. Yesterday, they were given the opportunity—the members of the opposition were given the opportunity to allow the Interim Supply bill to be put forward in the Legislature to protect front-line services. They rejected that opportunity. They were reckless with Manitobans' future. They were reckless with public services. There is something to be scared of, and it starts with the members of the opposition.

#### **Manitoba Hydro Privatization**

**Mr. Ron Schuler (St. Paul):** We wanted debate Bill 18 yesterday, except the government has pushed this Province into a fiscal cliff, and that's why we're debating the finances instead of Bill 18. It's their agenda, Mr. Speaker, and more to that, there is an advertisement being run. And it says, and I quote: During the last provincial election, the NDP promised not to raise the PST. It also promised Manitobans that the IBEW—and the IBEW not to privatize Manitoba Hydro. It broke its promise and raised the PST.

What makes the promise of not privatizing Manitoba Hydro any more credible? Basically, what it says, the NDP lied about the PST, the NDP lied about their plan to privatize Manitoba Hydro.

The question is: Why is this NDP government planning on selling Manitoba Hydro?

\* (14:20)

**Hon. Dave Chomiak (Minister charged with the administration of The Manitoba Hydro Act):**

Well, a couple of things, Mr. Speaker. Firstly, I don't think we asked to ring the bells all those hours yesterday when we could have been debating a supplementary estimate. Secondly, if the member really wants to talk about privatization of Manitoba Hydro, we are very happy to talk about privatization of Manitoba Hydro. We are very happy to talk about the record of the Conservative Party who promised not to privatize higher—Hydro—pardon me, not to privatize the telephone system, privatized it—*[interjection]* Well, I might stutter, Mr. Speaker, but at least I speak the truth. The rates have gone up. We don't have cell coverage around all of rural Manitoba, contrast that with Hydro which has the lowest rates in the country, and we're building for the future.

**Mr. Speaker:** Order. Before I recognize the honourable member for St. Paul (Mr. Schuler) for a supplementary question, I'm going to caution honourable members. The level and the volume here is increasing considerably in a very short period of time. So I'm asking for the co-operation of honourable members: please keep the volume down a little bit. We have guests that are with us in the gallery here this afternoon. I'm sure you want to leave a good impression with them of their visit to the Manitoba Legislature.

**Mr. Schuler:** Well, actually, Mr. Speaker, the following individuals, including: the CEC; the PUB; Ed Schreyer; Tim Sale; Len Evans; Graham Lane, former PUB Chair; Laurel Tolchinsky, hydro engineer, former vice-president; and now the IBEW disagree with the minister. In fact, they go so far so to say in an ad: diminished services and increased electrical rates all contribute to making Manitoba Hydro ripe for privatization.

Is this the NDP promise that you supported? Is this what you voted for? This is being run by working men and women, by unions in Manitoba. The NDP lied about the PST. The NDP lied about their plan to privatize Manitoba Hydro.

The question is: Why is this hidden agenda of the government now first coming out that they want to sell Manitoba Hydro?

**Mr. Chomiak:** Well, Mr. Speaker, you know, being asked by the Tories about privatizing Hydro is a bit like being a chicken in a—you know, Colonel Sanders in a hen house. The next thing the member's going to

say is they want partnerships with First Nations. We've heard such astounding stuff today.

Mr. Speaker, the—there's an arbitration matter that's going on with the IBEW. The IBEW has expressed some concerns.

I think, Mr. Speaker, I'd be prepared to debate the rest of summer and right into winter the prospects of what the Tories did when they wound down MTS. They didn't allow the capitalization. Remember that? There was \$800,000 in capitalization that was necessary, and they said we have to privatize it because there's no capitalization.

What are they saying now? Don't build it. Don't build a line that would provide reliability. Don't make the sales to United States. Same pattern—

**Mr. Speaker:** Order, please. The minister's time has expired.

**Mr. Schuler:** Mr. Speaker, I have never been so proud to be part of a PC Party that once, under the government of Duff Roblin, created Manitoba Hydro. I am so proud of that record. I am so proud of successive PC governments who built and fostered and developed Manitoba Hydro.

What concerns all Manitobans is the hidden agenda of this NDP who want to go out and now sell it. It's even their own NDP supporters. It's even the unions that are saying the NDP lied about the PST, the NDP lied about their plan to privatize Manitoba Hydro.

The question is, Mr. Speaker: Why is it now that the hidden agenda first comes out that the NDP want to privatize Manitoba Hydro, which was created by Duff Roblin and a Progressive Conservative government?

**Mr. Chomiak:** I see memories of Hugh McFadyen, Mr. Speaker.

You know, Mr. Speaker, firstly, we have the lowest hydroelectric rates in the country compared to all other provinces. Why is that? It's because we've invested in hydro.

Secondly, Mr. Speaker, we're running out of power. In 2022 we won't have power. In Ontario they're going nuclear; we don't want to go nuclear. In Saskatchewan they're building coal capacity by investing \$15 billion in coal; we don't want to go to coal. We want to go to clean, burning hydro. In addition, 44,000 work years will be provided by the

construction in the North. It'll boom the economy in the North.

If you want to talk about hollowing out the provinces, the Leader of the Opposition said, Mr. Speaker, how would you hollow out northern Manitoba if you didn't work with the First Nations, if you didn't work with people in the north to build Hydro for all Manitobans? It'll keep prices low and have power in the future—

**Mr. Speaker:** Order, please. Order, please. The minister's time has expired.

### **Flooding (2011) Housing for Evacuees**

**Mrs. Heather Stefanson (Tuxedo):** Yesterday I asked the Minister of Aboriginal and Northern Affairs questions about families who have been flooded out of their homes on First Nations located east of—in the east side of the Fairford control structure, Mr. Speaker, and two years later these people are—and these families are still out of their homes with no end in sight.

Now, the Minister of Aboriginal and Northern Affairs has said, and I quote, these families have been out of their homes for far too long. Mr. Speaker, he has been saying that for quite some time now, for far too long now.

When will he stop with the empty rhetoric and take action by ensuring that these people are back in their homes as soon as possible, Mr. Speaker?

**Hon. Eric Robinson (Minister of Aboriginal and Northern Affairs):** I want to thank my colleague from Tuxedo for asking the question, Mr. Speaker.

Indeed, what she asks is very important and I'm very glad to have my colleagues on the other side of the House become interested on this very important issue after two years. I believe that they should be commended in taking serious a very critical issue that we're faced with here in the province of Manitoba.

We have been working on various fronts to ensure that these people are returned to their traditional homelands. We have worked individually with the four First Nations—Pinaymootang, the Lake St. Martin First Nation, Little Saskatchewan and Dauphin River—and I want to commend each of the leaders of those communities in the leadership that they have extended—

**Mr. Speaker:** Order, please. The minister's time has elapsed.

**Mrs. Stefanson:** Mr. Speaker, we've been asking these questions for the last two years of the minister and of this government. They have put these people out of their homes. It's ridiculous, absolutely ridiculous.

Mr. Speaker, the minister said yesterday, and I quote: "I don't think anybody likes the idea of two years for people to be out of their homes. We don't feel good about it and I'm sure the people don't feel good about it." We agree with the minister.

When will the minister stop with the empty rhetoric and ensure that these people are back in their homes as soon as possible?

**Mr. Robinson:** Let me correct the record, Mr. Speaker. Yesterday was the first time I heard a question from the other side on this very issue.

Let me bring members up to date on what we have been doing. I want to, first of all, commend the leadership of that area, Lake St. Martin Chief Adrian Sinclair, Little Saskatchewan Chief Hector Shorting, Pinaymootang Chief Garnet Woodhouse, Dauphin River Chief John Stagg. And each of these First Nations, as I was saying, Mr. Speaker, have been working with the provincial government and the federal government to find solutions to these outstanding issues. These aren't easy to overcome. We have a working group representing the provincial government that's dealing with a number of issues. They also require the involvement of the Rural Municipality of Grahamdale. That's being taken into consideration.

Two years, yes, that's a long time to be away from your home, but let me also add, Mr. Speaker, that I—in my reference—or in my answer to the question raised by the member yesterday that I would be talking with the federal Minister of Aboriginal Affairs, and I did that and together last night we issued a joint statement on the issue of Misty—

**Mr. Speaker:** Order, please. The minister's time has expired.

**Mrs. Stefanson:** Mr. Speaker, perhaps I'll correct the record, because we've been asking these questions for some time. And the member for Lakeside (Mr. Eichler) has been asking questions, the member for Portage la Prairie (Mr. Wishart). There's other

members that have been asking these questions. Problem is we have yet to receive an answer.

I want to ask the Minister of Aboriginal and Northern Affairs once again, Mr. Speaker: When can these people expect to be back in their homes? What is the date? What is the timeline?

**Mr. Robinson:** This is a matter that we're in this together, Mr. Speaker, and let me correct the record.

If my memory serves me, the questions that were asked were about farm, which is also—farmers, which is important as well. They—the wrongdoings—the presumed wrongdoings of Aboriginal people at Tataskweyak Cree Nation, as another example, those are the questions that have been raised in question period, never about the well-being of the people that have been impacted by the 2011 flood.

\* (14:30)

#### **Sexual Abuse Case Concern Government Knowledge**

**Mrs. Leanne Rowat (Riding Mountain):** This week we learned of a young man who had been—or has been charged with sexual abuse of a sibling. He spoke up despite the fact doing so would result in a criminal conviction.

Timelines speak to tragic and incomprehensible story. November 2011, RCMP and CFS were notified that a sexual assault had occurred and a file was opened. On October 24th, 2012, after a second reported incident, the young offender was to appear before the courts—his first appearance.

Mr. Speaker, I ask the minister: Clearly someone had—have had to known in her department prior to July 12th, 2013, when she said she had first learned of this. Why wasn't any action taken prior to that, Mr. Speaker?

**Hon. Jennifer Howard (Minister of Family Services and Labour):** As I said yesterday, there is an ongoing review of this case with the southern authority. They are looking at the allegations that have been made that the agency didn't take the actions that it should've. They are taking those allegations seriously and they're doing a review of this case.

I want the member to know, though, that I—my office is not involved with RCMP investigations, Mr. Speaker. That would be wholly inappropriate for a minister of the Crown to insert herself in an RCMP investigation. The allegations of sexual abuse do not

come to my office for me personally to investigate, as they did not come to member for River East's (Mrs. Mitchelson) office for her to personally investigate. They go through the proper channels; they go to people who are trained.

If in this situation those allegations weren't taken seriously, we're looking into that, we're working with the southern authority and we'll take the appropriate action to make sure that the agencies are following the standards and following the law, Mr. Speaker.

**Mrs. Rowat:** Mr. Speaker, it's the minister's responsibility to protect children—vulnerable children in care. The Child and Family Services Act says an agency is required to investigate, and if they conclude the child is in need of protection, they must take steps to protect that child. It's an offence if they fail to do so.

Child and Family Services staff had a legal and moral obligation to protect the family involved and to respond to the abuser's request for help. He cried for help. It appears they did neither, Mr. Speaker.

Mr. Speaker: Does this minister not believe that it is unacceptable that CFS staff tried to silence the abuser and, even worse, refused to act? Where were the supports for this poor, poor family?

**Ms. Howard:** As I said on the first day that the member raised these questions, the allegations that have been made are extremely serious allegations. If it is true, as she has stated—if those allegations are true that an agency did not take its responsibility seriously, did not act when there were allegations of sexual abuse, that is extremely serious and it is not acceptable, and I said that on day one, Mr. Speaker.

That is why we're working with the southern authority to look at these allegations, to make sure that we're reviewing the case, that we understand what happened here. And if has been—has is been suggested, that an agency did not live up to its responsibilities under the law, we will make sure that corrective action is taken and that agency does live up to its responsibilities. That is what we're doing, Mr. Speaker.

**Mrs. Rowat:** What families are looking for is this minister live up to her obligation and protect children at risk.

Mr. Speaker, at the October 2012 court appearance several reports were ordered, including a psychological report, a pre-sentencing report and a forensic exam. The minister said in the House that

she only learned of this case on Sunday. Someone within her department had to have known of this case.

Does she not communicate with her deputy minister, who should've been aware of these details?

Mr. Speaker, I ask: Has she—has this minister misled the House or is she just incompetent in her role as minister? Either way, she has failed this poor family and so many more Manitoba families who are looking for support and care from this minister.

**Ms. Howard:** You know, members across the way have asked me to intervene in child welfare cases when there are RCMP investigations going on; have asked me to intervene in situations where charges have been laid. We do not intervene in those investigations. When an allegation of child sexual abuse is made or any kind of child abuse, the RCMP investigates, the CFS agency investigates. Our role and the role we are fulfilling is to make very sure that the actions taken by that agency were appropriate, and the southern authority is working to do with them.

If the member opposite truly cared about families in the care of the CFS system, she would talk to her member—she would talk to her leader and get him to be true to his word and make sure that we get Interim Supply passed so money can flow to those agencies. And, if she truly cared, she would take that action today.

#### **Sexual Abuse Case Concern Government Knowledge**

**Mrs. Bonnie Mitchelson (River East):** I think the minister has her priorities mixed up when she's more concerned about her House leader's duties than she is concerned about children that need protection at this moment.

Mr. Speaker, yesterday I asked the minister in question period whether the southern authority was aware before the weekend of any of the activities that were going on with the sexual abuse case. The minister didn't answer my question.

So I'm asking her today: Was the southern authority aware—since this case has been before the courts since October of 2012, was the authority aware of any of the issues surrounding this case?

**Hon. Jennifer Howard (Minister of Family Services and Labour):** I take my responsibilities very seriously, and part of my responsibilities as a member of the Crown and as the leader of the House,

part of my responsibilities is to make sure that daycare centres have enough money to operate. That's why it's important that we make sure that Interim Supply is passed. That's why it's important that the Leader of the Opposition be true to his word and not stand in the way of that money flowing. In my department we have half a million dollars available to support any domestic violence strategy. That money cannot flow until Interim Supply passes. The members of the opposition will have an opportunity to show if their actions match their words and if they care more about the welfare of Manitobans or their own political welfare, and we'll see which they care more about.

**Mrs. Mitchelson:** My question to the minister is very simple: Can she indicate to me whether the southern authority had any information, had any discussion or knew about this horrendous case of sexual abuse before Friday? This has been before the courts since October of 2012. Did the southern authority know?

**Ms. Howard:** As I've said previously on this case, Mr. Speaker, there's right now a case review going on. These allegations that were made, that we're discussing in the House, the allegations that an agency did not do their job, did not take allegations of sexual abuse seriously, that is a serious allegation. To my understanding, those allegations were made on Friday. On Sunday I became aware of those allegations. On Monday we asked the southern authority to look into it, to do a case review. That review is ongoing. When we have the results of that, we'll be able to know what happened and what actions we need to take to make sure the agency is aware of its obligations and is following its obligations. Those are the actions that were taken.

**Mrs. Mitchelson:** But the minister's own deputy was in charge of the southern authority that had responsibility for this agency from November of 2012 while this case was before the courts.

My question to the minister is: Has she asked her deputy whether he had any information or any knowledge about this case prior to Friday?

He was in charge. He is her deputy. Did she ask the question and has she received a satisfactory answer?

**Ms. Howard:** Let's be very clear about what happened with the southern authority. The board had fallen below three members; they needed an



administrator. The administrator has the role of the board. The administrator does not have the role of investigating child abuse, prosecuting child abuse. The administrator is there as the board. We've asked the southern authority to look into these allegations, which are extremely serious allegations, to come to some conclusion of those allegations and to ensure that we're taking any appropriate actions to ensure that the agency knows what its obligations are under the law and are following those obligations under the law.

That investigation will be completed, and we will take the appropriate action to make sure that children are protected. But we're also going to take the appropriate action and make sure that the money is there for those agencies so they can do that work.

\* (14:40)

### **Flooding (2011) Misty Lake Lodge Evacuees**

**Hon. Jon Gerrard (River Heights):** Mr. Speaker, last night I met with flood evacuees at the Misty Lake Lodge. Their stories would make even the coldest heart bleed and rise up in protest against the life too many of these people have had to lead over the last two years: moving from hotel to hotel, children's schooling constantly disrupted, families isolated and struggling. Misty Lake Lodge and access to schools in Gimli is one of the saving graces for these evacuees. But, due to this Province playing Ping-Pong with people's circumstances, families and children's lives will be disrupted once more on this trail of tears.

I ask the Premier to commit today and guarantee that these people will not be moved again until there are safe and stable homes for them to return to in their home communities.

**Hon. Greg Selinger (Premier):** Mr. Speaker, the member raises a very important question. These people have suffered enormously under the flood conditions of 2011 and not being able to return to their homes as soon as possible, which is exactly why we've taken every measure that we can to get them home as quickly as possible. That has included ordering ready-to-move homes that area available, identifying land that requires servicing in terms of drainage, putting permanent homes in place to allow them to go home as quickly as possible.

In the meantime, we will work with the federal government and the Deputy Premier (Mr. Robinson).

And the Minister for Aboriginal and Northern Affairs has been in touch with the federal minister responsible. They have issued a joint statement that they will work diligently, and we will all work together with the First Nations leadership to ensure these people have as stable lives as possible and as much support as possible until we can get them home to higher ground, safe houses and a situation where they will not be impacted in—by future floods.

**Mr. Gerrard:** Mr. Speaker, the reality is that too many of these people have been treated, oh, like Ping-Pong balls: shuffled and batted back and forth between the provincial government, the Manitoba Association of Native FireFighters and the federal government. And they've been out of their home, of course, for two years. They deserve better than this. You know, it's time for this Province, which is actually paying the public money on the invoices presented by MANFF, to stop playing games with people's lives and provide a real solution which will ensure this stability.

I ask the Premier: When will he actually ensure and ensure that the money gets to where it's supposed to go so that Misty Lake Lodge can stay open and people can know where they will be living and where their children will be going to school this fall?

**Mr. Selinger:** Mr. Speaker, this question is important. It has from the earliest moment of this tragic event of the 2011 flood been our priority to work with families, ensure children are in safe circumstances, and that is exactly why we have provided immediate shelter for people. We ordered ready-to-move homes immediately. We purchased higher ground in some of the communities to ensure that any rebuilds were in a place where they would be protected from future flood events. That is why we put the emergency channel in place, to bring down the lake an additional three feet and positioned equipment there this spring in case it was needed again.

In the case of any family that's still out of their home, we have moved forward in co-operation with First Nations leadership and the federal government to identify permanent, long-term solutions so they do not have to back to a circumstance where they will be at risk of flooding again. That has involved buying new homes; that has involved servicing higher land; that has involved acquiring higher land. We will follow through on all of those commitments, Mr. Speaker, in partnership with First Nations leadership and the federal government.

**Mr. Gerrard:** Mr. Speaker, you know, we need an answer in terms of what's happening at Misty Lake Lodge. We have Bertha Traverse who's been a flood evacuee who's staying at Misty Lake Lodge and doesn't know what the future will hold for her. We have Chief Adrian Sinclair who is here concerned about the people that he has at Misty Lake Lodge. We have Mike Bruneau who operates mystery lake lodge and, you know, would like to keep it open, but he can't under the circumstances where the bills aren't getting paid. You know, I think, Mr. Speaker, that the people who are staying at Misty Lake Lodge who are on this difficult circumstances deserve a clear answer from this Premier (Mr. Selinger).

Will they be allowed to stay at Misty Lake Lodge until they have to go home, until they can go home to their own communities?

**Mr. Selinger:** Mr. Speaker, I will table the notice that was put out yesterday by the federal minister and our provincial minister, our Deputy Premier (Mr. Robinson), and I will table it. And they have pledged to work together with First Nations leadership to ensure families are in stable circumstances. We want to ensure that they get home as quickly as possible, which is why we're engaged on working with them to identify the community infrastructure necessary and the homes necessary, what—which will stabilize those families. And we will continue to do that. We will continue to work with the federal government to do that. We will continue to work with First Nations to do that, and any organization designated to represent them on their behalf.

This statement, Mr. Speaker, is a pledge for co-operation and partnership to put people in a position where they never again will have to experience this kind of flooding. That is why we want the channel to be made permanent. That is why we've pledged \$250 million of flood protection around Lake St. Martin and Lake Manitoba. And I do remind all the members opposite, when we pledged that quarter of a billion dollars, that \$250 million, all—

**Mr. Speaker:** Order, please. The First Minister's time has expired.

#### **Aboriginal Children Nutritional Experiments**

**Mr. Ted Marcelino (Tyndall Park):** Mr. Speaker, the box of secrets that were kept in the National Archives of Canada hold enough sorrow, grief, regrets and hurt from the effects of residential

schools to the treaty violations that were inflicted on First Nations. We all bow our collective heads in shame.

And to think that yesterday, Mr. Speaker, Canadians were appalled once again to learn that during World War II and subsequent years, their federal government secretly conducted food deprivation studies on innocent First Nations children without the knowledge of their parents or guardians.

My question to the Minister of Aboriginal and Northern Affairs is: What can be done to address this shameful history?

**Hon. Eric Robinson (Minister of Aboriginal and Northern Affairs):** I want to thank my colleague the member for Tyndall Park for raising a very important question, Mr. Speaker. Upon learning about this yesterday, first, of course, my initial reaction was that of shock, and secondly, I guess, a feeling of sadness, because the community that these experiments were taking place at were at the community that I was born.

Racism is too kind of a word to describe this action. I think that it is more an act of genocide by the government of that day towards Aboriginal people. And we are going to be communicating with the federal government to extend the mandate of the Truth and Reconciliation Commission.

This morning I spoke with Justice Murray Sinclair to get his take on his understanding. And, Mr. Speaker, there's a lot of outstanding issues yet that the Truth and Reconciliation Commission must hear, including forced sterilization on women and girls at these residential schools, and many of these residential schools also served as recruitment centres for our young men to serve in the military in the great wars of years gone by.

Mr. Speaker, the work has to continue.

**Mr. Speaker:** Time for oral questions has expired.

#### **MEMBERS' STATEMENTS**

##### **The People of Snow Lake**

**Mr. Clarence Pettersen (Flin Flon):** Mr. Speaker, a community's strength is determined by the support and compassion that members show each other. Through encouraging kindness, looking out and caring for one another, the town of Snow Lake has proven itself to be a very strong community.

Mr. Speaker, last month the people of Snow Lake came together to help one of their neighbours in need. On June 21st, many town residents attended a fundraiser held for Dari Miller, a mother in Snow Lake who has been battling cancer since her diagnosis in February. The generosity of the community was incredible. Through the penny parade, raffle, bake sale, barbecue, sno-cone and cotton candy sale, the community was able to raise thousands of dollars for Dari Miller and her family.

The community participated by attending the fundraiser, donating prizes, buying raffle tickets and much more. Many people in Snow Lake also dropped off baking for the bake sale. Even the daycare co-ordinator brought in cookies that were made by the kids at the daycare and read: made with love and care by all Dari's friends at the daycare.

This heartwarming story of a community coming together in support of their neighbour is a need—indeed inspiring. This display of compassion has truly shown how important community is for all people, because no one should face illness alone. As Dari is on a difficult journey, she knows that her friends and family are supporting her, thinking of her and praying for good health.

\* (14:50)

Mr. Speaker, the people in our lives who show us empathy and generosity make such an incredible impact. They hope—they give us hope and strength to continue when times are tough. I would like to ask all members of the Legislature—Assembly to join me in thanking the people of Snow Lake for caring for their neighbour and wish Dari Miller and her family continued strength and hope as they travel on this difficult journey.

Thank you, Mr. Speaker.

### **Pelican Yacht Club**

**Mr. Cliff Cullen (Spruce Woods):** Mr. Speaker, I rise today to recognize the Pelican Yacht Club, located at the northern tip of Pelican Lake in Ninette, Manitoba, a true hidden gem.

Sailing on Pelican Lake dates back to the turn of the century. At that time, sailing was connected to the Manitoba Sanatorium, or the San, as it was known by the locals.

The yacht club was founded in August 1965 and was affiliated with the Manitoba Sailing Association at that time. The club's role and mission was to, and is to, promote competitive sailing and youth sailing

programs on Pelican Lake. Dr. A.L. Paine, a long-time sailor and medical superintendent at the sanatorium, was unanimously elected to serve as the first—the club's first commodore.

The club is known for its junior sailing programs, great hospitality, social events and ability to organize successful regattas.

The club has hosted the 1997 Canada Summer Games and the 2004 Mobility Cup.

In May 1967, the old Pelican Lake School was acquired for \$205. It was moved to the northern tip of the lake, where it stands today. In 1968, the Pelican Yacht Club received approval from the Department of Tourism and Recreation to create a yacht club.

Today the clubhouse has all the amenities, consisting of a full kitchen, bathrooms, dining and meeting rooms and a deck that overlooks the marina. The club is one of 20 registered sailing clubs in Manitoba. I am proud to be a member of the Pelican Lake—pardon me, the Pelican Yacht Club. I would like to acknowledge all the volunteers who continue to serve the yacht club that make it a vibrant part of the community.

I invite all members of this House to visit the yacht club on beautiful Pelican Lake to witness the scenic views of this hidden gem, take time to meet the dedicated volunteers who make this club successful and stay for a boat tour of the lake.

Mr. Speaker, I seek leave to add the names of the club's commodores into the record.

**Mr. Speaker:** Is there leave of the House to include the names of the commodores to the day's Hansard of these proceedings? *[Agreed]*

*Past Commodores: Leanne Treloar, 2012-13; Roger Conrad, 2010-11; Michael Cox, 2008-09; Dr. Michael Taylor, 2007; Leanne Treloar, 2005-06; Doug Treloar, 2003-04; Dennis Collingwood, 2002; David Leech, 2000-01; Michael Leech, 1998-99; Winnie Baird, 1996-97; Russ McBean, 1994-95; Dennis Collingwood, 1992-93; Harold Hicks, 1990-91; Dr. Mel Roberts, 1988-89; Dave Clement, 1987; Gerry Gerrard, 1985-86; Charles Hughes, 1984; Dr. Michael Taylor, 1982-83; Ken Wood, 1981; Harold Baird, 1980; Lloyd Horner, 1978-79; Gordon Henderson, 1977; George Durnin, 1976; Norm Emerson, 1975; Jack Yellowlees, 1973-74; Dr. Frank Purdy, 1971-72; E.H. Harrison, 1969-70; Dr. A.L. Paine, 1967-68*

### **Cross Lake Chicken Club**

**Mr. Frank Whitehead (The Pas):** Mr. Speaker, northern communities live on beautiful natural lands, the same lands as our ancestors. However, living in the north also has its restraints, such as limited access to healthy food. Because of changing food sources, Aboriginal people can no longer rely solely on traditional diets and now must often rely on food being shipped up from Winnipeg. This frequently results in a lack of access to healthy food which, in turn, can lead to malnutrition.

Today, I would like to talk about a positive initiative that combats malnutrition and empowers Cross Lake families in their ability to learn healthy, sustainable food practices through raising chickens in their community. The Cross Lake Chicken Club was developed two years ago by Food Matters Manitoba and the community of Cross Lake.

Last year, seven families raised 350 chickens, and this year nine families are participating in raising 425 chickens. Through this project, the families build chicken coops, learn to raise the chickens and use the poultry and eggs to sustain their families.

The chicken club has helped to bring the community of Cross Lake together by fostering new skills. Many friends and family take part in raising the chickens, watching them grow and benefiting from the gifts their labour bring.

Students at D.R. Hamilton School are raising 50 chickens as a class project, while learning responsibility through caring for the poultry and also discovering food that doesn't come—that just doesn't just come from the grocery store.

Last year, one participant gave 31 chickens away to elders and community members, explaining that it was their way of giving back to the elders for all they have done for the community.

Mr. Speaker, it's a wonderful—it's very wonderful that these families in Cross Lake are learning the important skill of raising chickens. Not only does this teach healthy and sustainable food practices, it also teaches the community respect, awareness and responsibility.

I would like to thank Food Matters for organizing this chicken club, and I wish to congratulate all families involved. This is a great learning experience for our youth and aids them in becoming future leaders in Cross Lake.

Thank you, Mr. Speaker.

### **Judy McCaskill**

**Mrs. Leanne Rowat (Riding Mountain):** I am pleased to rise in the House today to recognize an entrepreneur in my constituency of Riding Mountain.

Sandy Lake business owner Judy McCaskill was recently—the Women Business Owners of Manitoba—was recently at for her outstanding—recognized for her outstanding contribution—business contribution and continued community support at the 21st annual Manitoba Women Entrepreneurs of the Year gala.

Judy has been the owner of the Sandy Lake Hotel since 2001. Since then, she has grown a successful business that locals and tourists alike flock to for good food, good entertainment and a friendly atmosphere year round. I have had the pleasure of experiencing this great atmosphere and, of course, Judy's fabulous food.

Judy has added an outdoor deck and a stage area, new flooring and paint throughout and remodeled the kitchen. She has also brought in a wide variety of entertainment, including a hypnotist, psychic card reader, comedians and karaoke performers, and provides a free shuttle service to ensure that bar patrons arrive home safely. Sandy Lake Hotel even offers their own meals-on-wheels plan for shut-ins, a selfless act that is greatly appreciated by many of the community members.

The Saturday evening meat draws have become a popular way of fundraising for local groups like the Sandy Lake handi-van, Trans Canada Trail, and Sandy Lake swim program. These meat draws have raised over \$226,000 since their inception, for over 25 different organizations. As well, Judy hosts an annual weekend fundraiser for Westman Dreams for Kids. She has also helped to set up trust accounts for community members facing serious challenges and donates money and prizes to a wide variety of area events. She has helped Sandy Lake adapt from being an agricultural service centre to a magnet for recreation and tourism.

Thank you, Mr. Speaker, for the opportunity to recognize one of the many people who have made positive changes in Manitoba. You go, Judy. Thank you.

### **Financial Management**

**Hon. Jon Gerrard (River Heights):** Mr. Speaker, today the Canadian Taxpayers Federation delivered over 8,000 signatures to the Legislature, signatures from Manitobans who want this NDP government to

demonstrate fiscal responsibility. The government may be trying to silence Manitobans with Bill 20 eliminating a referendum, but these signatures which I table now demonstrate that they will be heard.

Money mismanagement was evident when this NDP government produced a deficit, overexpended last year's budget by \$130 million. Asking Manitobans to provide even more money while they dig a deeper hole with an even greater deficit in this year's budget is not providing the citizens of this province with any sense of security on how the government manages their money.

Breaking promises and ignoring the law, as the NDP are doing by not following the requirement for a referendum, seems all too commonplace with this government. The government shows no respect for Manitobans, and, sadly, Manitobans can't trust this government.

This government's fiscal irresponsibility and poor management has resulted in insecurity and isolation for many of the people who are still homeless two years after they were artificially flooded. Verbal assurances mean very little to the families and children whose lives are being continuously disrupted by the very people they're supposed to be able to trust.

Chief Adrian Sinclair and councillors Christopher Traverse and Emery Stagg joined us in the gallery today. They were here with flood evacuees like Bertha Traverse, who remain homeless after two years. How can they believe that they can have stable lives and ongoing education for their children, let alone ever get safe homes to finally live in, when they were the ones who suffer when this government can't keep track of what it's managing and where the money is supposed—is going, when it's supposed to get there to help them?

They don't need empty promises; they need safety and stability. They need permanent, safe homes to live in with clean, running water, and until they can move into these homes, they need to know that their families will not be torn apart and scattered anymore.

\* (15:00)

All Manitobans deserve a government they can trust in finances and in decency and being able to manage and get things done. It's time that this NDP government stopped playing a shell game of blame and take responsibility for the financial and organizational mess that they've created. Thank you.

**Mr. Speaker:** Grievances.

Seeing no grievances—

## ORDERS OF THE DAY GOVERNMENT BUSINESS

### House Business

**Hon. Jennifer Howard (Government House Leader):** Mr. Speaker, I noticed yesterday that the member for Spruce Woods (Mr. Cullen) publicly offered that they were willing to do Interim Supply in an hour, so I want to take him up on that offer. And I can't think of a better way to use an hour. They may have to forgo their daily run to Starbucks, but on House business, would you canvass the House—

### Point of Order

**Mr. Speaker:** The Official Opposition House Leader, on a point of order.

**Mr. Kelvin Goertzen (Official Opposition House Leader):** Mr. Speaker, I heard you call orders of the day, and I heard you recognize the Government House Leader, and then she seemed to start into a debate.

Now, the Government House Leader, I know, is trying to present a certain picture. Last week we agreed on a certain way that the House would proceed. The Government House Leader actually read those rules into the House. I don't know what's happened over the weekend, if she spent \$5 billion and suddenly they're broke. But she knew what the rules were last week and how we would proceed this week, and so I'm just asking her to respect the rules. If the government is somehow broke over the weekend from when she signed the agreement, she can indicate that they are now broke. I doubt that's the case. They had—we put in place an agreement in terms of how this week would proceed. I know the government doesn't like to follow rules. They don't like to follow the law, but she put forward the agreement in the House. She read it into the record, and we're just trying to follow the agreement. If suddenly they've spent \$5 billion over the weekend and they're broke, they can let us know. Otherwise, follow the agreement, follow the law and do your job.

**Mr. Speaker:** The honourable Government House Leader, on the same point of order.

**Ms. Howard:** Well, Mr. Speaker, last week, the Leader of the Opposition said they would not get in the way of Interim Supply. I believed him. That was

my error. I took him at his word. Yesterday I gave them an opportunity to move through the rest of the votes that we had deferred from this week in a timely way. We're all here; we're all ready to vote; we can vote one after the other, or they could continue to take an hour for each vote so they can go take a nap or do whatever it is that they do in that hour, or we could move through it and we could get to Interim Supply.

Yesterday the member for Spruce Woods (Mr. Cullen), the acting House leader, said that he was willing to do Interim Supply in an hour. I've got an hour. They've got an hour. Is there a better way to spend an hour than making sure that non-profit organizations, that child-care centres don't continue to have to wait for their grants? I don't think so.

So I would ask, Mr. Speaker, as I was rising on House business, what I was asking for is leave that the House set aside the outstanding business of the Committee of Supply in order to proceed with Interim Supply and then the House sit today late, from 5 to 6 p.m., in order to make up for that time.

Are they here to serve the interests of Manitobans? And I am sure—

**Mr. Speaker:** Order, please. Order, please. We're dealing with a matter of point of order here, and I want to have the opportunity for both sides to have their say and then I'll make a ruling on it.

The honourable Government House Leader, to quickly conclude, please.

**Ms. Howard:** If they—if that's what they're here for, then, I'm sure they will give leave today to deal with Interim Supply so that the things that Manitobans need they can continue to receive and, then, we can get back to the other business of the House. If that's what they're interested in, I'm sure they'll give leave today, Mr. Speaker.

**Mr. Speaker:** On the point of order raised by the Official Opposition House Leader (Mr. Goertzen)—and I'd like to thank all honourable members for their advice on this matter—one of the things that I find uncomfortable as your Speaker is that the two sides of the House are negotiating House business on the floor of the House. I have cautioned the House several times before. It's my preference that we not debate matters and use points of order to do that. I'd prefer to do that through the normal question and answer period. I'd prefer to do that through the debate on legislation or in committees or any other number of forums that this Assembly has to debate

various topics. So I would discourage members from using points of order to debate.

On the point of order raised more specifically, I did not hear a specific breach of a rule or procedure or practice of the Assembly, even though I understand the sentiments of the House with respect to this matter.

I would encourage the House leaders, members of the parties involved, to perhaps use the loge to my left or my right or any other spaces available in this building to talk about the business of the House and bring back those decisions to the House without engaging in debate during the proceedings of—at the start of orders of the day. So that's my caution to the House.

On the—more specifically, on the point of order raised, I must—since there was no rule that was referenced as having being breached, I must respectfully rule that there is no point of order in this particular circumstance.

\* \* \*

**Mr. Speaker:** Now, I believe the govern—honourable Government House Leader was about to get to some business, and might I encourage her to go directly to that business.

**Ms. Howard:** On House business. Would you canvass the House to see if there is leave that the House set aside the outstanding business of the Committee of Supply in order to proceed with Interim Supply and that the House also sit today from 5 p.m. to 6 p.m. in order to make up for that that time?

**Mr. Speaker:** So is there leave of the House to set aside the outstanding business of the Committee of Supply in order to proceed with Interim Supply and the House also sit today from 5 to 6 p.m. in order to make up for this time? Is there leave?

**Some Honourable Members:** Leave.

**Some Honourable Members:** No.

**Mr. Speaker:** I hear a no, so therefore leave is denied.

**Ms. Howard:** Would you please move into Committee of Supply.

**Mr. Speaker:** We'll now resolve into the Committee of Supply as referenced on today's Order Paper.

Mr. Deputy Speaker, will you please take the Chair.

**COMMITTEE OF SUPPLY**

**Mr. Chairperson (Tom Nevakshonoff):** Order. Will the Committee of Supply please come to order.

In accordance with the agreement reached in the House on July 10th, 2013, the committee will now continue voting on motions and accompanying resolutions deferred from sittings of the Committee of Supply last week.

\* (15:10)

**IMMIGRATION AND MULTICULTURALISM**

**Mr. Chairperson (Tom Nevakshonoff):** The next question before the committee is the deferred resolution 11.1: RESOLVED that there be granted to Her Majesty a sum not exceeding \$419,000 for Immigration and Multiculturalism, Executive, for the fiscal year ending March 31st, 2014.

*Resolution agreed to.*

\* \* \*

**Mr. Chairperson:** The next question before the committee is the motion moved by the honourable member for La Verendrye (Mr. Smook), during the Estimates of the Department of Children and Youth Opportunities,

THAT line item 20.1.(a) the minister's salary be reduced to \$1.08.

A recorded vote having been requested, call in the members; requested by two members, call in the members.

*All sections in Chamber for a recorded vote.*

\* (16:10)

**Recorded Vote**

**Mr. Chairperson:** Order. The one hour provided for the ringing of the division bells has expired. I'm directing that the bells be turned off and the committee proceed to the vote.

The question before the committee is the following motion moved by the honourable member for La Verendrye (Mr. Smook),

THAT line item 20.1.(a) the minister's salary be reduced to \$1.08.

*A COUNT-OUT VOTE was taken, the result being as follows: Yeas 19, Nays 29.*

**Mr. Chairperson:** The motion is accordingly defeated.

**CHILDREN AND YOUTH OPPORTUNITIES**

**Mr. Chairperson (Tom Nevakshonoff):** The next question before the committee is the deferred resolution 20.1: RESOLVED that there be granted to Her Majesty a sum not exceeding \$1,002,000 for Children and Youth Opportunities, Administration and Finance, for the fiscal year ending March 31st, 2014.

*Resolution agreed to.*

\* \* \*

**Report**

**Mr. Mohinder Saran (Chairperson of the section of the Committee of Supply meeting in room 254):** Mr. Chairperson, in accordance with the agreement reached in the House on July 10, 2013, I'm reporting the following motions and resolutions deferred from our sitting on July 11, 2013, in room 254.

During the consideration of resolution 12.1 from the Estimates of the Department of Conservation and Water Stewardship, the honourable member for Arthur-Virden (Mr. Maguire) moved

THAT line item 12.1.(a) be reduced to \$1.08.

This motion was defeated on a voice vote, and subsequently two members requested a recorded vote. The accompanying resolution 12.1 has also been deferred for a vote.

During the consideration of resolution 34.1 from the Estimates of the Department of Healthy Living, Seniors and Consumer Affairs, the honourable member for Spruce Woods (Mr. Cullen) moved

THAT line item 34.1.(a) be reduced to \$1.08.

This motion was defeated on a voice vote, and subsequently two members requested a recorded vote. The accompanying resolution 34.1 has also been deferred for a vote.

During the consideration of resolution 14.1 from the Estimates of the Department of Culture, Heritage and Tourism, the honourable member for Lac du Bonnet (Mr. Ewasko) moved

THAT line item 14.1.(a) be reduced to \$1.08.

This motion was defeated on a voice vote, and subsequently two members requested a recorded vote. The accompanying resolution 14.1 has also been deferred for a vote.

Mr. Chairperson, that concludes my report.

**Mr. Chairperson:** Thank you.

\* \* \*

**Mr. Chairperson:** The next question before the committee is the motion moved by the honourable member for Arthur-Virden (Mr. Maguire), during the Estimates of the Department of Conservation and Water Stewardship,

THAT line item 12.1.(a) be reduced to \$1.08.

A recorded vote has been requested by two members. Call in the members.

*All sections in Chamber for recorded vote.*

**Recorded Vote**

**Mr. Chairperson:** Order, please.

Question before the committee is the following motion moved by the honourable member for Arthur-Virden,

THAT the line item 12.1.(a) be reduced to \$1.08.

*A COUNT-OUT VOTE was taken, the result being as follows: Yeas 19, Nays 29*

**Mr. Chairperson:** The motion is accordingly defeated.

\* \* \*

**Mr. Chairperson:** The hour being after 5 p.m., committee rise.

Call in the Speaker.

**IN SESSION**

**Mr. Speaker:** The hour being past 5 p.m., this House is adjourned and stands adjourned until 10 a.m. tomorrow morning.



**LEGISLATIVE ASSEMBLY OF MANITOBA**

**Wednesday, July 17, 2013**

**CONTENTS**

<b>ROUTINE PROCEEDINGS</b>			
<b>Petitions</b>		Manitoba Hydro Schuler; Chomiak	3522
Provincial Sales Tax Increase–Referendum		Flooding (2011) Stefanson; Robinson	3524
Driedger	3513	Gerrard; Selinger	3527
Mitchelson	3517	Sexual Abuse Case Concern Rowat; Howard	3525
Applied Behaviour Analysis Services		Mitchelson; Howard	3526
Friesen	3513	Aboriginal Children T. Marcelino; Robinson	3528
Rowat	3514	<b>Members' Statements</b>	
Pedersen	3515	The People of Snow Lake Pettersen	3528
Cullen	3515	Pelican Yacht Club Cullen	3529
Stefanson	3516	Cross Lake Chicken Club Whitehead	3530
Maguire	3516	Judy McCaskill Rowat	3530
Briese	3517	Financial Management Gerrard	3530
Helwer	3517		
Schuler	3518		
Smook	3518		
Graydon	3518		
St. Ambroise Beach Provincial Park			
Wishart	3514		
Reopen Beausejour's Employment Manitoba Office			
Ewasko	3514		
Personal Care Homes and Long-Term Care– Ashern			
Eichler	3515		
<b>Oral Questions</b>			
PST Increase			
Pallister; Selinger	3520		
Helwer; Selinger	3521		
		<b>ORDERS OF THE DAY</b>	
		<b>GOVERNMENT BUSINESS</b>	
		<b>Committee of Supply</b>	
		Immigration and Multiculturalism	3533
		Children and Youth Opportunities	3533

The Legislative Assembly of Manitoba Debates and Proceedings  
are also available on the Internet at the following address:

**<http://www.gov.mb.ca/legislature/hansard/index.html>**